#### The Incidental Music of "O Holy Night" and its Tonal Symbolism of the Holy Trinity Analysis by: Robert Aguirre

	Moderate and alle the
"O Holy Night"	i out a staft fit go staft all hilling and the said in the fit good
"Cantique de Noel"	tigget all only site in the total
Music by: Adolphe Charles Adam	
(18031856)	
Poem and Lyrics by: Placide Cappeau (18081877)	and a serie and a serie of the series of the
Original Title: (French) "Minuit, Chretiens" (English) "Midnight, Christians"	
	איוהויא עושפות עולייייויא

### Historical context of composition

The current version of "O Holy Night" that is so popular with the 21<sup>st</sup> century yuletide celebrant has evolved over its 167 years of existence and has a rich and impactful history. Adolphe Adam's composition commission by French priest in 1847 was immediate popularity with the local 19<sup>th</sup> century Frenchman. The Catholic Church would become an adversary of "O Holy Night" with its paradoxical prohibition of "O Holy Night," the religious song dedicated Christian savior. Despite this prohibition, however, Adam's song would still be performed prolifically and would remain a musical leviathan. Achieving worldwide fame in 1906, "O Holy Night" ushered in a new era by being the very first song to ever be played live over the air via AM/FM Radio by the Violin of Reginald Fessenden, Thomas Edison's employee.

The cover version of "O Holy Night" that is performed by popular artist such as Celine Dion, Mariah Carey, Nate King Cole and John Williams is slightly different from the 1847 version because it contains lyrics that were added seven years later by John Sullivan Dwight. The priest's commission of "O Holy Night" was not a commission for a musical work but was actually only for a poem by Jewish wine salesman Placide Cappeau.

The poem was written mid a catholic midnight mass and was to tell the arduous story about the birth of Christ. Upon completion of the Poem "Midnight, Christians," Placide Cappeau felt proud of his work and decided the story needed to be expressed in the musical medium and so he commissioned Adolphe Adam. Adam was the right composer for this task because he composed a lot of incidental music. If one were to compose music to accompany a story in the form of a poem then the best thematic presentation would be with Incidental Music.

The thing that is most interesting about the tonal organization of O Holy Night is that the tonal pallet and harmonic colors that Adam realizes and makes available for his compositional facility in 1847, walking on the heels of posthumous Beethoven is what makes it even more impressive and a masterpiece

### The Incidental Music of "O Holy Night" and its Tonal Symbolism of the Holy Trinity Analysis by: Robert Aguirre

The emotional power inherent to the Christmas song "O Holy Night" is created by Adolphe Adam's utilization of the compositional style known as incidental music. In particular the incidental music's disposition of both tonal and rhythmical attributes. Incidental music is the style of musical composition that accompanies a play, ballet, and in modern times the soundtrack that accompanies a motion picture. This style of music is said to be played incidental to the event's main focus of the ballet, play or movie. This pairing of art forms and the musical composition's inferior role in the main event is what most describes incidental music. The craftsmanship of incidental music requires more talent than the run of the mill 19<sup>th</sup> century composer adhering to the tonal rules of functional harmony. As head of composition at the Paris Conservatory in 1850's, Adolph Adam was at the cusp of nineteenth century tonal progression with his role in the early development of the French style of music—that would later be referred to as—the Impressionistic musical period.

Although not married to a play, ballet or movie; the music of "O Holy Night" was commissioned to accompany the poem "Midnight, Christians" by Placide Cappeau, and "Midnight Christians" was commissioned to be recited for the live audience of a Catholic midnight mass. The music of "O Holy Night" incidentally portrays the poems pathos of man's suffering and redemption regarding the birth of Christ. This portrayal is accomplished with strong musical imagery which I will refer to as "musical emotional states."





There are four different "musical emotional states" that correspond to the poem's narrative about the birth of Christ. The first three 'musical emotional states' of, 'vulnerability', 'intoxication' and 'sobriety,' tell the narrative about the struggle and progression of Christians as they await the coming of Jesus Christ. The last 'musical emotional state' is 'Alleluia' and it corresponds to the praise and adoration for the birth and arrival of the Savior. The four "musical emotional states' are labeled below in Figure 1.0



#### **Figure 1.0 ~ Musical Emotional States**

- Vulnerability: measures 1-11; capable of being physically or emotionally wounded Lyric: pinning ~ verb ~ fix blame of responsibility for something on someone; hold some firmly in a specified position so they are unable to move
- 2) Intoxication: measures 12 15; Weary-
- **3) Sobriety:** measures 16-19; Fall on your knees,
- 4) Alleluia: measures 20-27 Divine Holy

#### Emotional State # 1) Vulnerability- measures 1—1

The vulnerability of the first 'musical emotional state' is created by the quirky and ambiguous structure of the opening melody. The nebulous melody creates vulnerability in harmony with strange sonorities and in the rhythm with the anacrusis and upbeat feel. Because the melody affects the harmony and rhythm, the harmonic structure eccentricities and rhythmic structure eccentricities will both be focused on. Figure 1.1 shows the opening melody of "O Holy Night" in the key of C major. For analytical purposes the opening melody is defined as measures 1 -11 which comprise phrase one and two of a three phrase asymmetrical period. For a mental reference think of the well know and recognizable opening tune of "O Holy Night."



The rhythmic ambiguity begins with the mysterious nature of the first two measures and Adam's lack of information regarding the classification and phrase properties of these first two measures.



A subjective observer listening to "O Holy Night' could perceive the first and second measure as a pick up measure, or as a two-measure pickup gesture. To define the first and/or second measure as a pick up would not be far from its intended function. However; it is troublesome to assign the theoretical definition of a pickup to measure one or two because they do not meet its requirements. Traditional western musical dictates that the additional beats of an anacrusis which occur at the start of the composition must be subtracted from the last measure of the composition in order to keep the number of measure in the entire composition at a whole number and not really to maintain the overall formal symmetry of a composition. The origins of this beat-robbing-rule stems from the classical aesthetic preference for symmetry, heaven forbid a composition contains sixteen measures and an additional one beat pickup instead of the symmetrical sixteen beats even. But the last measure of "O Holy Night" is void of any stolen beats and unlike other traditional anacrusis measures there is no a conservation of energy but an addition to the composition. We get something out of nothing just like the Immaculate Conception. But there is a simple remedy for this situation.

The ambiguous nature of the first two measures can also be exemplified with the performer and their understanding of these measures. The performance modifications that are made to the infamous first two measures by twentieth-century popular artist are done primarily to establish a bearing in the ambiguity that Adam has composed into the opening two measures of the song. The performers attempt to establish barring by modifying the first two measures include adding beats, subtracting beats, adding additional measures, changes the meter, adding a longer intro, and even completely omitting an intro. Of all of the popular recordings that are available, the only artist that plays the first two measures verbatim is Nat King Cole. There is a complete list of artist's performance eccentricities located in part B of this paper. These subtle changes that are made by pop artist are quite interesting but are not as pertinent to the current explanation, so to get back to the matter at hand.

Although Adam did not verbally notate on the sheet music the gestural function of the first and second measures, one can still find out his intention for these measures by the information that he did leave behind ion the sheet music the form of cadences and how they relate to the opening melody. Strong formal cadences along with other harmonic movement will establish and define phrase parameter. This is because the opening melody consists of the first two phrases of a three phrase asymmetrical period with antecedent-antecedent-consequent phrasing. This means that the phrasing of the first two phrases are a double antecedent and organized according to antecedent-antecedent phrasing and therefore each phrase has common harmonic phrasing. So, if there are cadential regularities among the phrase parameters of the first and second phrases, particularly at the beginning and ending of the phrases, we should be able to locate the starting count and measure of phrase two with which to define phrase one.

The side by side comparison of the first two phrase's cadential occurrences and regularities will expose the phrase parameters and can provide insight on how to classify this troublesome introduction. See Figure 1.2



The information acquired from figure 1.2 about the opening melodies phrase parameters is simultaneously a step forward and backward for our understanding of phrase parameters. On the one hand, the melodic content juxtaposition of phrase one and two reveal cadential commonalities amongst the phrases, the most important commonality is that both phrase's structural cadence occurs and the same time in each phrase. If the halting of harmonic movement by a structural cadence is what is used to define the end of a phase, and if the structural cadence of phrase one and two occur and the same point in the phrase then we have clearly defined parameters of where phrase on and two end. However, on the other hand, the harmonic rhythm of each phrase is not in sync with the meter. Chord harmonies are tied across the bar line and the strong structural cadence on beat three of each phrase's fourth measure is off by two beats. Figure 1.2 establishes bearings for phrase length but not meter orientation.

For correct metric orientation of the structural cadence it must occur on either to beat one of measure four\* or beat one of measure five\*. It is hard to reconcile moving it two beats either way because the structural cadence occurs fifteenth beats after the starting note of the phrases, while standard structural cadence of four bar phrasing occurs on beat thirteen and five bar phrasing occurs on beat seventeen.

If we move the cadence two beats later to the first beat of measure five it will create a five measure phrase and two silent counts at the beginning of each phrase, and moving it two counts earlier to beat one of measure four will create a two beat pick up to measure one and two silent counts at the beginning of phrase two. Either option would create rhythmic ambiguity, yet one of them is needed to articulate the harmonic rhythm as Adam intended. This tells us that there is a pickup in the first two measures of at least two beats and that there is something rhythmically weird going on between phrases one and two. We need to visit the complete eleven measures of the first two phrases. Figure 1.3 shows a organizing of the opening eleven measures. Although the ambiguous first two measures have been included and taken into account, their presence does not disrupt the cadential commonality and its defined phrases parameters that are displayed in Figure 1.2



Although the phase length of the opening melody is 5 bars in length it doesn't create nearly as much vulnerability in the rhythmic structure as does the perceivable harmonic stasis that exist between the first two phrases caused by the asymmetric length of the melody. The melody is eighteen counts long while the phrase totals twenty beats in length and both phrases have a pickup. What is going on here? I knew that there had to be more and after more research I found out what.

The two-count upbeat feel that occurs in "O Holy Night" comes from the two count anacrusis indigenous to the French dance know as the 'Gavotte' The gavotte's eccentric preference is that the melody start in the middle of the measure on beat 3. The idiomatic French practice of the queer two-count pickup and the metric eccentricities was invented by France's indigenous Alpine mountain population. It is also commonly found in the French 17<sup>th</sup> century medium paced dance, the Gavotte.

There is really no regular sense of meter between the first two phrases because of the addition beats that occur in between these phrases. Even on the repeat it sounds weird because none of the other in between spaces of the six phrases contain this beat growth of measure six and seven.

![](_page_6_Picture_4.jpeg)

The harmonic structure of the opening melody is unusual due to the ambiguously represented collection of Db major diatonic notes that comprise the opening melody primarily the starting pitch. To start with the melodic structure: I believe Adam conceived this melody in F minor and then adapted it to fit in Db major. The cadence of the second phrase, measures 9 - 11, in F minor is theoretically weaker than the first phrase's cadence in measure 5 - 6, the strong chord progression of measure 9 - 11, which tonicizes F minor, is melodically stronger with respect to the resolution of the melody, because of the F minor characteristics of the melody. The tonal scheme of the first musical period complies with the phrase practice of a musical period, even thought the second cadence of the period is in a distant nonfunctional key of the mediant F minor, it is stronger than phrase one's perfect authentic cadence in tonic Db major.

Only a composer with slick chromatic skills would be able to pull off this harsh tonal shift in a Christmas song. The pivotal chord that achieves this brief F minor modulation is a Db dominant seven chord with an added sharp eleven chord extension. So now the problem is with the exotic nature of the pivotal dominant seventh chord built on the tonic of Db major. Thankfully, there is a simple great prognosis.

The chord is only exotic enharmonically! When spelt correctly its functional harmony is quite traditional especially for French National music. The correct harmonic spelling of the pivot chord is a French augmented  $6^{th}$  chord based in the key of F minor. The Augmented sixth chords created new and hip sound for the music of the 1800's and provided a new vehicle for tonal modulations.

In the first movement of Beethoven 'Eroica' Symphony, he utilizes a French augmented  $6^{th}$  chord in the same fashion as Adolphe Adam. Beethoven and Adam both use the augment  $6^{th}$  chords to introduce and add new modified scale degree classes, and relative pitch distances to spice up the current tonal pallet. This new expansion of tonal color is used throughout the composition, ultimately redefining the original tonic pitch classes.

This melodies' F minor heritage does function and fit well in the key Db major but more importantly it helps to symbolize the Holy Trinity with the introduction of the mediant F minor tonal center The harmonic anticipation for F minor comes from several sources. The first and most apparent are the sonorities of the pivotal French augmented sixth chord. The change in pitch class reconciles the identity and structure of the opening melody by obliging its affinity and resting spot of F. The base line that accompanies this key modulation is very smooth. Db – Db – C – C – F. This huge French augment sixth harmonic event helps to justify and straighten out the identity of the opening melody and Adam gives a moment of resolution

The Plagal cadence on beat one of the fourth measure provides a spiritual affair and also creates the familiar harmonic ebb and flow.

![](_page_7_Figure_4.jpeg)

![](_page_8_Figure_0.jpeg)

#### Emotional State # 2) Intoxication: measures 12 - 15

The first note of the piano arpeggiated in measure 12 is a G flat that quickly leaves behind F minor tonal focus. The G flat is in the harmonic company of octaves C notes in the bass voice and an A flat in the melody voice. This A flat dominant tonality is strengthened in measure twelve with a bass A flat quarter note on beat two and again on beat 4 and is colored by the presence of a B flat in the melodic voice on beat two. This added ninth chord extension creates a weary less functioning dominant tonality indicative on the impressionistic period. The resolution of this A flat dominant ninth chord in measure thirteen is to a B flat in the melodic voice, octave D flats in the bass voice and an F in the piano arpeggiated voice. Although indicative of Bb minor, the melodic voice B flat note colors a Db major tonality with added sixth. The same Ab dominant ninth chord appears in measure fourteen and the same Db 6 chord appears in measure fifteen producing the chord progression of phrase three: AB9 – Db6 – Ab9 – Db6. The dominant and tonic chord function is further upset and homogenized by the use of common extension note Bb on Ab9 chord and Db major sixth chord.

Although there is dominant to tonic movement from measure 12 -13 and measure 14-15, Adam's use of the syncopated Ab pedal during the Db major chords provides continuity of dominant function within the four measures of this consequent phrase. The Ab quarter note dominant pedal that occurs every other beat on count two and four of every measure prolongs the dominant function creating a sense of inebriation that marches on for four measures to a deceptive surprise. This four measure Impressionist-like dominant chord entity is what provides the intoxication effect and the deceptive cadence that occurs at measure 16. The added pitch for both chords is the symbolic Holy Trinity Bb sonority. The chord extensions help to foreshadow the coming of Bb minor by way of deceptive cadence.

#### Emotional State # 3) Sobriety: measures 16-19

Again, as a great composer Adam will generate interest in the new Bb minor tertian tonal trinity by creating harmonic anticipation leading into tertian harmonic areas. And to acknowledge the new Bb sub mediant trinity, Adam creates harmonic anticipation with the four measure Ab dominant ninth chord. The deceptive cadence that occurs in measure sixteen is heightened with the additional voices and thickened texture of the choir chorus. Figure 1.2 shows Adam's clever harmonic anticipation composition techniques.

#### Emotional State # 4) Alleluia: measures 20-27

These two phrases praise fully enhances the harmonic reward of the final cadence by increasing the dissonance of harmonies through suspensions, retardant and appoggiatura. This increase of dissonance creates an unstable tonal/harmonic center which makes it seem like the structural PAC cadence will elude us.

The compositions emotional power also comes from the tertian tonal centers on either side of Db tonic. Resulting in the mediant and sub-mediant tonal centers in lei of the dominant and sub dominant tonal centers. The tonal Symbolism of The Holy Trinity with Mediant and Sub-Mediant tonalities is very significant to the nature of this discussion, but I will begin analysis on the local phrase level followed by the overall formal scheme.

The symbolism of the Holy Trinity is accomplished by Adam's use of tertian tonal centers above and below the tonic Db Major. The use of the Db Major's F minor mediant tonal center located a third above Db major, and the use of Db major's sub-mediant tonal center of Bb minor located a third below Db major. These tonal centers represent the divine geometry of the number 3 and the Holy Trinity. Being the great composer that Adam's was he reinforces the less recognizable tertian tonal centers by generating interest in the tertian tonal trinities by creating harmonic anticipation leading into tertian harmonic areas. Figure 1.2 shows Adam's clever harmonic anticipation composition techniques.

![](_page_10_Figure_2.jpeg)

# **Musical Form:**

- There is strong continuity in the composition's overall form and its integral parts
- Adam's proficient 'Incidental Music' compositional skill provides the energy that bring the composition alive
- Strong melody and voice leading.
- Excellent contrast from A section to B section
  - Contrast in tonality and rhythmic motion
  - o Contrast in Adam's "Orchestral Blanketing"

**Introduction/ Anacrusis:** Is effective in creating rhythmic ambiguity.

- Irregular start due to the gavotte's
- Phrase begins on the third quarter note, crotchet, of the bar creating a half measure upbeat.

### **<u>SECTION - A:</u>** The first two phrases of the composition are cinq pas 5 measures long

- **<u>Phrase 1</u>**: Db tonic. Phrase length of 5+5+5=15 beats. While 14 beats is standard
- **<u>Phrase 2</u>**: F minor , the distance tonal mediant is ushered in by French augmented sixth chord built on the tonic Db pitch as lowest note
  - French augmented sixth chord
    - Gorgeous chord it sounds so stark b/c the harsh melodic introduction of G natural is centered around the uncommon tone of Db major and F minor. G natural is also a tritone away from tonic Db major.
  - Utilization of the new harmonic colors and proper treatment of new leading tone tendencies caused by the altered chord
  - In the first movement of Beethoven 'Eroica' Symphony, he utilizes a French augmented 6<sup>th</sup> chord in the same fashion as Adolphe Adam. Beethoven and Adam both use the augment 6<sup>th</sup> chords to introduce and add new modified scale degree classes, and relative pitch distances to spice up the current tonal pallet. This new expansion of tonal color is used throughout the composition, ultimately redefining the original tonic pitch classes.
  - Creation and repeated use of Ab > G-natural leading tone
    - G-natural >Ab leading tone is also utilized
    - G-natural is b 13<sup>th</sup> scale degree of Db major
    - The interesting thing is that he doesn't use the modified G –natural to tonisize the Ab dominant scale degree. Instead he used a French augmented 6<sup>th</sup> chord to color the G-natural and this augmented chords resolves the way it should to a C chord of some variety which then turns in a C7 dominant and finally resolves to a F minor center.
    - Adam's wants the G color modification to
- **<u>Phrase 3:</u>** Ab7 dominant function with a continuous rhythmically syncopated Ab quarter note pedal.
  - Adam's use of the syncopated Ab pedal during the Db major chords ultimately makes the Db chords have a dominant function that leads and seems to resolve the Bb minor chord. The strong tonicization of the Db with the Ab7 chords directs our ears to Db as a tonal center. The Db from this phrase carries over to the start of the next phrase. The Db is the highest sounding pitch at the start of phrase 4. Colored by the Bb minor chord the Db functions as a minor third.
  - Strong implied Deceptive Cadence between the last chord of this phrase, a Db tonic chord, and the first chord of the next phrase, a Bb minor chord

## **SECTION - B:**

- Phrase 4) Shout Chorus
  - Closed chord voicing's

- o Strong root movement of 4ths and 5ths
- Phrase 5 and 6)
  - Enhances the harmonic reward of the final cadence by increasing the dissonance of harmonies through suspensions, retardant and appoggiatura. This increase of dissonance creates an unstable tonal/harmonic center which makes it seem like the structural PAC cadence will elude us.

# • Silver Attribute No. 1) Blues Orientation

- Overall formal layout is organized as a jazz improvisatory lead sheet.
  - Adolphe Adam improvised professionally everyday a pianist
  - Adolphe Adam's lead sheet chord orientation due to his daily improvisational keyboard playing.

# • <u>Billboard Attribute No.</u> 1) Divine use of number 5 "Cinq Pas"

- Adolphe Adam uses the inherent properties of a Gavotte and Gillard dance to represent the divine number "5" and exhausts the saviors birth
- 5 represent divinity. The 3 in the Holy Trinity + the 2 of Man's Dualism = 5 Divinity
- o 5 bar "cinq pas" phrases of the A section as symbolism for divine geometry,
- o and this asymmetrical effect on gestural time
- The 5 movements of the "Cinq Pas" take up 6 beats of music
  - 4 motions on the first 4 beats followed by a leap in the air after beat 5 and a landing on beat 6

The crotchet literally translates from French to English as an eccentric preference, and implies an eccentric opinion or preference, peculiar trick or device, a highly individual and usually eccentric opinion of preference. The crotchet is also the tool used to weave yarn together when crocheting.